

To the Accreditation Council of  
the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care  
December 12, 2022.

**REPORT**  
**OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE**  
**ASSESSMENT OF JSC "KAZAKH RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF ONCOLOGY AND**  
**RADIOLOGY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL**  
**ACCREDITATION OF MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF POSTGRADUATE AND**  
**ADDITIONAL EDUCATION (CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)**

**external expert evaluation period: November 28-30, 2022**

**Almaty, 2022**

## CONTENT

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Submission Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology"	5
2.2	Information on previous accreditation	6
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on institutional self-assessment Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology" for compliance with the Standards for institutional accreditation of medical organizations of postgraduate and additional education (continuous professional development) and conclusions	7
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation based on the results of external evaluation Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology"	10
5.	Recommendations for institutional improvement Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology"	35
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	36
	Attachment 1. Institutional quality profile and external evaluation criteria Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology"	37
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	38
	Attachment 3. Programme of the organization's visit by the external expert commission	39

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
MSI	Municipal State institution
JSC	joint-stock company
GPA	Grade point average (Weighted average assessment of the level of educational achievements of the student in the chosen specialty)
ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
PBL	Problem based training
TBL	Team based training
EMC KAZRIOR	Educational and Methodological Council of KAZRIOR
JSC "KAZRIOR"	Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology"
AMP	Administrative and managerial personell
BD (O)	Basic disciplines (training)
GP	General Practitioner
University	Higher Educational Institution
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES	State compulsory Educational Standard
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources
DLT	Distance Learning Technologies
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care
FSA	Final State Attestation
PEC	Postgraduate Education Center
IEP	Individual educational plan
KAZRIOR	Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology
CVI	Coronavirus infection
CC	Component of coice
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MoH of RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEE	Medical Educational Organization
MJ RoK	Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC " Asfendiyarov KazNMU "	Non-profit Joint-Stock Company " Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
SRI	Scientific Research Institute
RRW	Resident's Research work
SSC	Scientific Student Circle
STP	Scientific and Technical programme
NCIE	National Center for Independent Examination
FLS	Fundamentals of Life Safety
PO	Public Organization
EP	Educational programme
OSCE	Objective structured clinical exam

## 1. Composition of The External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 28 of 07.11.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external institutional assessment of KazRIOR JSC in the period of November 28-30, 2022, consisting of the following members:

n/	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree / title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairperson	Kabildina Nailya Amirbekovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of "Oncology and Radiation Diagnostics", oncosurgeon of the State Public Health Institution NJSC "Karaganda Medical University"
2	Foreign expert	Urmanbetov Kubatbek Samyybekovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department, Deputy Director for Science, Chief Physician, Senior Researcher of the Research Institute of Heart Surgery and Organ Transplantation MoH of the Kyrgyz Republic, Bishkek. Acting Professor at the Kyrgyz State Medical Institute for Advanced Training and Retraining of Personnel of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic
3	Academic expert	Shakirova Aida Fazylovna	Oncologist -gynecologist of the highest qualification category, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, senior resident, oncogynecologist of the Center for Multidisciplinary Surgery of "National Scientific Cancer Center"LLP
4	Academic expert	Urazaev Olzhas Nurlanovich	PhD, Associate Professor, Associate Professor of the Department of "Oncology" of NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
5	Representative of employers	Shamsutdinova Alfiya Gumarovna	MD, MSc, BA, Fogarty Fellow, Director of the Children's Medical Center "Helmir Kids", President of the Association of Bioethics and Medical Law, Doctor of the highest category in Public Health Care,
6	Representative of residents	Abylgazieva Aidana Bakytzhanovna	resident of the second year of study in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" of the National Research Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

Observer from ECAQA-Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (ECAQA Director General's Order No. 4 of 13 February 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of KazRIOR JSC for compliance with the Standards of Institutional accreditation of Medical organizations of Postgraduate and Additional Education (Continuing Professional Development) (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Representation of KazRIOR JSC

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", 9900240007098
Management Body	Board
Full name of the first head	Kaidarova Dilyara Radikovna
Date of establishment	Order of the MoH of the Kazakh SSR No. 1-15-33 dated 05.07.1960
Location and contact details	Almaty, 91 - Abaya Street Phone: 8 (727) 2921064 E-mail:kazior@onco.kz Official Web site: <a href="https://onco.kz/">https://onco.kz/</a>
State license for educational activity in the residency programme (date, number)	No. KZ82LAA00012887 dated 04.03.2010 (without deadline) with Appendices dated 28.09.2018 for educational activities in three specialties of postgraduate education: radiation therapy (radiation oncology), Oncology (adult) and radiation diagnostics
Information about branches and subsidiaries (if available)	
Year of commencement of <b>residency</b> training (postgraduate education) and total number of graduates	Year of commencement -2022 Total number of graduates since the start of residency programmes -
Duration of residency training	Educational programme "7R01124 - Oncology (adult)" - 2 years Educational programme "7R01115-Radiation Oncology" - 2 years
Number of residents in the current academic year	Educational programme "7R01124-Oncology (adult)" -12 people. Educational programme "7R01115-Radiation Oncology" - 3 hours.
Quality indicators in the residency programme	Number of expulsions for the period of 5 years-no Employment rate, % in dynamics over 5 years: 2017 -100 2018 -100 2019 -100 2020-no information 2021-no information
Year of start of implementation of <b>additional and non-formal education programmes</b> , total number of programmes and number of students enrolled	Year of start – 2022 Total number of additional education programmes – 2, 120 and 150hours Total number of non-formal education programmes – 2, 120 and 150 hours.

Number of students in the current year	
Full-time teachers / part-timers involved in the implementation of residency and additional education programmes, including %	Total number of teachers - 11, including full-time teachers- 11. Graduation rate, % - 72.7 Categorization, % - 100
Availability of a division responsible for the educational process	Name-Center of Postgraduate Education Centre (PEC) Year of establishment-2022 Head-Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna, MD
Number of scientific projects for 5 years	4
Number of international agreements for 5 years	5
Information about accreditation as a medical organization (date, no., period)	No. KZ37VEG00012515 dated 27.07.2022

### **Educational organization's strengths and achievements over 5 years:**

Today, the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology is the leading organization in the Republic of Kazakhstan for providing diagnostic and therapeutic care to cancer patients, as well as a clinical base for training and retraining personnel in oncology and radiation therapy. During the reporting period, more than 600 practical health care professionals were trained. The Institute is equipped with state-of-the-art equipment of the latest generation for full-fledged and in-depth diagnostics and treatment of tumor processes. Modern laboratories of the Institute perform all types of laboratory research from general clinical to molecular genetic.

KazRIOR is accredited for the right to conduct clinical trials of pharmacological and medicinal products, medical devices and medical equipment (Order No. 39 of 24.02.2017) The Institute publishes the journal "Oncology and Radiology of Kazakhstan", which is part of the RSCI, HAC of MES RoK.

The network of cancer dispensaries in the regions has significantly expanded. Researchers of the Institute have prepared and published a number of textbooks on clinical oncology in Russian and Kazakh, which are still used by students and residents. Postgraduate education programmes are developed taking into account the proposals of employers and other stakeholders, based on an analysis of the needs of practical health care.

Advanced diagnostic and treatment methods developed by the Institute's staff are implemented in leading cancer centers of the CIS countries, India, Sweden, Peru, England and regional cancer dispensaries of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, KazRIOR has all the material and human resources, the quality of training is ensured by creating values for consumers through educational programmes, the qualification of teaching staff, the quality of teaching and organization of the educational process, the equipment of the clinical base, the development of international activities, and the effective use of a network of republican partners to meet the ever-increasing needs of consumers

### **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

Since KazRIOR JSC became a part of NJSC KazNMU, there has been no admission to the residency programme since 2019. The organization Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology" was accredited as an independent institution in 2017. Independent Kazakhstan Agency for Quality Assurance of Education (IQAA).

### **2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on the institutional self-assessment of KazRIOR JSC for compliance with the Standards for institutional accreditation of medical organizations of postgraduate and additional education and conclusions**

The report on the institutional self-assessment of KazRIOR JSC (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 100 pages of the main text, 22 pages of appendices, copies or electronic versions of 20 documents located at the link [https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1RT-0EE\\_7uj6Ph4scoHZ1jegKS-6Jsbo3?usp=share\\_link](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1RT-0EE_7uj6Ph4scoHZ1jegKS-6Jsbo3?usp=share_link).

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structuring taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-assessment Guide for Medical Educational Organizations provided to KazRIOR JSC by the ECAQA accreditation center, as well as internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Dilara Radikovna Kaidarova, Academician of NAS RoK, Chairperson of the Management Board of KazRIOR JSC, which confirms the accuracy of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 4 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self-assessment - Saule Esenkulova, Head of the KazRIOR Postgraduate Education Center.

The institutional self-assessment was carried out on the basis of the order of the Chairperson of the Management Board 08.07.2022 No. 221a dated 08.07.2022 " On approval of the composition of the working group on self-assessment and preparation for institutional accreditation of JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology". The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: Kabildina Nailya Amirbekovna, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes that were taken into account in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization and the self-assessment report was made appropriate changes and additions.

In all standards, the real practice of organizing education for training residents in two specialties and trainees in two programmes of additional and non-formal education is given. The description in the self-assessment report is fairly complete and up-to-date in terms of the number of residents, trainees, teachers, administration, information about selection and admission, training results, and results of knowledge and skills assessment. It includes information about its own material and technical base with a total area of 24,145 m<sup>2</sup> and the number of beds - 430, as well as third-party clinical bases (2 in total), contractual obligations with partners (NJSC "KazNMU"), financial information, development and improvement plans, etc.

The report is presented in ECAQA in a complete form, with data correction based on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the standards criterion, tables and figures contain links in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the institutional self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure – external assessment. Experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e., verify quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work within the framework of the institutional assessment of KazRIOR JSC was organized in accordance with the Guidelines of ECAQA for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes and in accordance with the programme approved on November 11, 2022. Order No. 28 by S. S. Sarsenbayeva, CEO of ECAQA, and the date of visit to the organization agreed with D. R. Kaidarova, Chairperson of the Management Board: November 28-30, 2022.

External evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the institutional self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of implementation of the visit within 3 days is described in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), see Attachment 3. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

The following methods and results were used by EEC members to obtain objective information:

- interview with management and administrative staff -3;
- interviews with residents -15;
- exploring a website (<https://onco.kz/>)
- interviewing 14 employees, 11 teachers, and 6 mentors;
- survey of teachers and residents-10 and 15, respectively;
- monitoring the training of residents:
  - attending practical classes for residents of the 1st year of study of the educational programme 7R01124 "*Oncology (adult)*", topic: "Cervical cancer", teacher PEC KazRIOR-Kukubasov E. K.
  - attending a class in the form of an MDG consultation with the participation of residents of specialty 7R01124 "*Oncology (adult)*" on the topic: "Discussion of complex clinical cases". Teacher of PEC, head of the operational unit Nasrytdinov T. S.
  - attending a practical lesson for residents of the 1st year of study of the educational programme 7R01115 "*Radiation Oncology*" on the topic "Rectal cancer", teacher PEC KazRIOR-Kim V. B.
- review of resources in the context of implementation of accreditation standards: visited the base of practice/clinical engagement of the Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", centers and departments where training is conducted in 2 educational programmes with the participation of 11 full-time teachers / part-timers;
- study of educational and methodical documents in the amount of 20 units. both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (**see Attachment 2 for a list of documents studied**).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites and interviews is ensured (Table 1).

**Table 1-Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and interviews with EEC members**

#	Position	#
1	Dilara Radikovna Kaidarova- MD, Professor, Academician of NAS RoK, Chairperson of the Board of "KazRIOR"	2
2	Bakhytzhan Ongarbayev-Deputy Chairperson of the Board of "KazRIOR" for Clinical work	4
3	Oksana Shatkovskaya - Deputy Chairperson of the Board of "KazRIOR" AG for Scientific and Strategic work	3
4	Dias Toleshbayev - Chairperson of the Council of Young Scientists KazRIOR	1
5	Esenkulova Saule Askerovna-head of PEC	6
6	Dzhakipbaeva Aizhan Kumiskaliyevna-specialist of PEC	6
7	Urazgalieva Madina Giniyatovna- Head of the Center for Molecular and Genetic Research	1
8	Gabbasova S. T. - Head of the Department of hemablastosis	1

9	Kalieva Zh.Zh. - Head of the Department of hemablastosis 1 departments of Endoscopy and Functional diagnostics	2
10	Savkhatova A.D.-Head of the radiotherapy day hospital	2
11	Abdrakhmanov R. Z. - Head of the Department of Radiotherapy. chemotherapy	2
12	Smagulova K. K. - Head of the Department. day hospital chemotherapy	2
13	Serikbaev G. A. - head of the CCMT	2
14	Dzhumanov A. I. - head AOC	2
15	Yelesizov A. M. - head of CTO	2
16	Amankulov J. M. - head of DEP.diagnosis	2
17	Nasritdinov TS - head of operation block	4
18	Abdrakhmanova A. J. - the head of the BTC	2
19	Kukoverov E. M - the head of the COG	3
20	Cabarov M. E. - head CTHN	2
21	Kim Viktor Borisovich - developer EP in Radiation Oncology	4
22	Makarshina Bibigul Tasbulatova - Chief of staff:	1
23	Zhumabek Aisulu Certianity - resident 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	3
24	Jumataev Bekzhan Burgandy resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	3
25	Yendalov Daniyar Sabirjan resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	3
26	Abdazimov Laura Beganova resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	3
27	Kenjebayeva Zhanara Serikovna - resident 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	4
28	Muratova Erkezhan Erlantz resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	4
29	Abat Abylaikhan Muratuly resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	4
30	Iemberdi Mahabbat Narysy resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	4
31	Zhienbaeva Aigerim JANBAAZ resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	4
32	Nikita Ryazanov V. 1 resident year of training KAZRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	4
33	Kuanysh Akniet Orazymbetkyzy - resident 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	4
34	Kenshi Togan Serikkyzy resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Oncology (adult)"	4
35	Ganibaev Doszhan Gandalovic resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Radiation Oncology"	3
36	Bakytzhanova Gabit resident of 1 year of study KAZRIOR "Radiation Oncology"	3
37	Nurzhanov Renat Erlanovich resident of 1 year of study KazRIOR "Radiation Oncology"	3
38	Bartlewo Orynbasar Orazgaliev – a graduate of the residency programme	1
39	Goncharova Alena Andreevna– graduate residency programme	1
40	Guseinov Suhrab Goulaouic– graduate residency programme	1
41	Eshniyazov Orazbek Bekmurzaevich– graduate residency programme	1

42	Sakarya Olzhas Muratovic– graduate residency programme	1
43	kadyrbaeva Rabiga Esengeldy– graduate residency programme	1
44	Kusleev Aziz Alisherovich– graduate residency programme	1
45	Pysanova Zhanat Umirzakovna-graduate of residency programmes	1
46	Satanova Alima Rinatkyzy– graduate of residency programmes	1
47	Sloneva Nina Viktorovna– graduate of residency programmes	1
48	Turkpenova Innara Talgatovna– graduate of residency programmes	1
49	Uskembay Aliya Kairatkyzy– graduate of residency programmes	1
50	Khvan Nikolay Sergeevich– graduate of residency programmes	1
51	Baymoldayeva Mariam - Economic Department	1
52	Satanova A. R.-clinical mentor	3
53	Bertleuov O. O.-clinical mentor	3
54	Dmitrienko M. S. – clinical mentor	3
55	Imanbekov B. O. – clinical mentor	3
56	Kadyrbaeva A. E. – clinical mentor	33
57	Raskaliev R. K. – clinical mentor	
58	Olzhaev S. T.-employer of graduates of residency programmes and additional education	1
59	Izmagambetov N. A. -employer of graduates of residency programmes and additional education	1
60	Saparova E. K. -employer of graduates of residency programmes and additional education	1
61	Maulenov Zh. O. - employer of graduates of residency programmes and additional education	1

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The EEC members have started to draft the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of external evaluation are made. Experts individually completed the " Institutional quality profile and external evaluation criteria of the Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology " for compliance with ECAQA accreditation Standards".

External evaluation observations made to KazRIOR staff by EEC members:

- 1) And innovative training methods are not fully used and are not reflected in syllabuses.
- 2) The practice-based IEPI has not been finalized in response to specific learning needs.
- 3) There was insufficient training to improve pedagogical skills.
- 4) The Clinical Audit, Management and Quality Service does not have an employee responsible for the educational process.

Recommendations for improvement for the educational organization were discussed, and the chairperson of Kabildina N. A. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the team, prompt provision of information to EEC members. All the standards present the actual practice of organizing education for training residents in the specialties "Oncology (adult)" and "radiation oncology", reasoned data, examples of the implementation of educational programme tasks, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. In the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, the experts received answers to the questions that arose and made appropriate changes and additions to the self-assessment report based on the recommendations of the reviewers.

The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and up-to-date in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information about selection and admission,

training results, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans, etc. improvement.

When conducting a survey of residents, 73.3% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, 6.6% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (100%) believe that it is necessary to carry out accreditation of an educational organization or educational programmes.

According to 90% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the EEC Chairperson announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external assessment within the framework of institutional accreditation.

### **3. Analysis of compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation based on the results of an external assessment Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology"**

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

##### **Proof of compliance:**

##### **1.1 Mission statement**

When implementing the activities of the visit programme, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Educational and Methodological Council, in interviews with residents, students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. We also found out that the mission and vision of the organization explain the essence of the activity, specifics and development path of KazRIOR JSC. They are posted on the official website <https://onco.kz/> and are available in all divisions of KazRIOR JSC.

All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of residents and students through the website, social networks, informational letters to medical organizations. Reviewed the organization's strategic plan approved by the decision of the KazRIOR Board of Directors dated 10.07.2020. No. 5 for the period of 5 years for 2019-2023, which includes such areas as: 1 Training of specialists on the basis of KazRIOR, 2 Advanced training of specialists of the cancer service on the basis of KazRIOR, 3 Training of specialists in the framework of master classes, 4 Advanced training of PHC specialists, 5 Attracting leading foreign specialists to KazRIOR, 6 Improving the quality of scientific research that confirms compliance with the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives, and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it is established that before starting classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, and training bases.

In the course of visiting the departments, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the educational organization, including: The institute with a rich history, the Republican flagship of the Cancer Service, a strong material and technical base, Human resources (academic and clinical staff, scientific potential, high degree of stability), the Journal "Oncology and Radiology of Kazakhstan" is included in the CCES list, Broad and active international cooperation, Stable financial position of the Institute, the average age of employees is 42 years.

KazRIOR has departments that are directly related to the educational process, which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the Center for Postgraduate Education (PEC). This conclusion is made because continuous training of cancer care personnel in all regions is clearly demonstrated to improve the skills of specialists, improve their professional knowledge and skills.

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the KazRIOR JSC organization and the educational process are built in accordance with the SCES and current regulatory legal acts (NLA) in postgraduate education and health care.

With regard to additional and non-formal education, the following is defined: KazRIOR JSC has all the resources necessary to develop professional qualities and achieve the final results stated in the mission of the educational programme in accordance with national and international requirements and the needs of the health sector.

### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

Visiting the clinical base, attending an open class, meeting with teachers and residents allowed us to see that by adhering to a patient-centered approach in the clinical process, while maintaining the need for assistance, each resident develops an individual level of such quality as professionalism. The formation of professionalism is formed on the basis of direct training in the workplace, where residents face clinical situations of various levels of complexity, learning from the experience of senior colleagues, and thereby building their own behavior model.

3. Based on the Law on Education RoK, which establishes the autonomy of organizations of higher and postgraduate education, which gives the right, on the basis of standard rules, orders, NLA etc. KAZRIOR JSC determines independently the development of the educational programme, assessment, selection and admission of residents, selection/selection of teachers, employment conditions and resource allocation.

The Regulations on Residency reflect the rights of residents, the implementation of which is facilitated by the Department of Science and Education. Ensuring the freedom of expression of a resident's opinions on their training is usually carried out through anonymous questionnaires, which are carried out centrally.

During interviews with residents, it was found that freedom of practical and research activities is realized through the work of residents, where research work is carried out under the guidance of a center employee, subsequent analysis and interpretation of data, and then writing an article or thesis.

Residents can send their suggestions and comments on the organization of the educational process (class schedule, etc.), the programme of training in elective subjects, the list of elective subjects, the library fund, and other issues directly related to the learning process to the director's blog, complaints and suggestions box, and the hotline phone number.

To verify **standard 1**, a meeting was held with the head of the organization "KazRIOR"JSC. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: 1. How many years was there a break in the training of residents? 2. Does the Institute have a quality management system for its educational activities? 3 Are there any financial risks? 4. Who is the Chairperson of EMC? 5. How will the compliance of teachers and clinical mentors of the residency programme with the goals and objectives of the programme be analyzed?. During the responses, the director of the organization confirmed that 1. The break in training was 3 years. 2. The Institute has a QMS for clinical work. 3. There are financial risks, but they are manageable. 4. Chairperson of EMC – Head of PEC. 5. Based on the results of reporting activities and certification of teaching staff and mentors.

When conducting a survey of 15 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational programme. It is established that 80% of residents will recommend studying in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. A 73.3% of respondents believe that educational programme managers and teachers are aware of students' learning problems. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 93.3% of residents answered positively, 6.67% are not sure about this, % could not answer this question yet, and % would like to believe it.

During the conversation with the students, the following information was obtained: in this educational organization, the necessary knowledge in the specialty is acquired. We are also impressed by the strong material and technical base.

10 teachers surveyed (21 questions of the questionnaire) they also answered that 100% are satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization. Experts have determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees, and responds promptly to requests and suggestions. In the questionnaire, 100% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization. According to 100 % of educational organizations, a teacher has the opportunity to become a professional in their specialty. For your information, a total of 10\_ people responded (there are 11 employees in total), while 10% of teachers have up to 5 years of teaching experience, 40% have up to 10 years of teaching experience, and 50% have more than 10 years of teaching experience.

### **1.3 Final learning outcomes**

When formulating the final learning outcomes, the SCES Core Competencies (Attachment – 1.7 EP CC 1-6), Levels of clinical competencies (PD, DT, E, P, etc.) and Levels of practical skills, manipulations, and procedures (1-4) were used as the basis. Each of these points is prescribed and applied to nosologies (ICD-10) studied in residency in the priority training of a specialist. Skills of professional behavior, proper behavior and attitude to patients and their relatives, resident colleagues, teachers, and other health care workers are formed on an ongoing basis through interviews, participation in trainings conducted by the Institute's employees, and a 360-degree questionnaire.

KazRIOR JSC pays considerable attention to compliance with the standards of conduct, the "Code of Ethics" (Attachment 6), as well as the Academic Integrity of students (Attachment 5). This mechanism includes: familiarizing employees and students with the provisions of internal regulatory documentation, requirements for the organization of the educational process, the main areas of work of structural divisions, internal regulations of the Center, etc.; creating a corporate culture based on equality of rights and obligations of employees and students, respect for their personal dignity.

The Code of Business Ethics is based on the principles of corporate social responsibility. Students are guided by universal moral and ethical principles, observe the corporate culture. Manifestations of interethnic differences, religious extremism, nationalism, and corruption offenses are unacceptable in KazRIOR. The academic nature of the center's teachers helps support the further development of students' commitment to the continuous development of professional competencies, scientific knowledge, and the principle of confidentiality of patient-related information. All provisions of the Code must be strictly implemented (<https://onco.kz/>).

Since the educational programmes (EP) of the residency are focused on the expectations of the employer and the needs of the labor market, the elements of EP and CED are coordinated with employers. Employers and members of professional associations are involved in reviewing the EP and participating in the discussion of the results at meetings of the EP Quality Assurance Commission.

The teachers surveyed said that 50 % are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 40 % are partially satisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programmes

100 % of teachers-respondents believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme.

### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

All employees and their divisions participated in the development of the KazRIOR mission. Administrative and clinical staff note the need for synergy of research, education and clinical activities to achieve the Mission of KazRIOR. Representatives of key stakeholders are involved in the formulation of KazRIOR's mission and goals by participating in extended discussions and

discussions. KazRIOR ensures that representatives of residency and employers are included in the advisory bodies. Responsible for the management of the educational programme are the PEC and the advisory bodies (EMC and the Academic Council), which, along with the PEC teachers, includes representatives of residents and practical health care (PEC KazRIOR Regulation, 2022).

Additional and non-formal education programmes are based on the proposals of professional associations, employers, and the administration of clinical bases, as there is a shortage of personnel in the country.

When talking to residents, trainees, employers, and experts, the answer was received to the question "Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the organization, the educational programme?", "What is the personal contribution of residents, for example, to improving the educational programme?". Residents answered these questions that suggestions and suggestions were taken into account and accepted, and employers answered that the catalog of elective subjects was also discussed jointly.

*Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.* Out of 14 standards conform: fully - 14, partially-0, do not correspond-0.

*Standard 1: completed*

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **2.1 Model of educational programmes**

According to the Minutes of the meeting of the MoH RoK Commission No. 1 dated 17.05.2022 on the placement of the state educational order for the training of medical personnel in residency for the 2022-2023 academic year, KazRIOR JSC has allocated 13 places in two specialties: 7R01124 - Oncology (adult) and 7R01115-Radiation oncology.

In accordance with the SCES, the structure of 2 educational programmes consists of a mandatory component (132 credits) and an elective component (4 credits) and obtaining qualifications-oncologist and radiation oncologist, which also meets the requirements of SCES-2022 of 04.06.2022 MOH RoK order No. KR DSM-63. The mandatory disciplines/modules reflected in the document, as well as the elective university component, are formed in the educational programmes. Also, 2 credits are allocated for the intermediate certification and 2 credits for the final certification. Thus, the labor intensity for training oncologists and radiation oncologists is 140 credits.

For the implementation of educational programmes in the specialties 7R01124-Oncology (adult) and 7R01115-Radiation Oncology. the organization's documents contain EMCDS, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with SCES and standard requirements is established. Attending practical classes for residents of the 1st year of study of the educational programme 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)", the topic: "Cervical cancer", the teacher of PEC KazRIOR - Kukubasov E. K. and attending a class in the form of an MDG-consultation with the participation of residents of the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" on the topic: "Discussion of complex clinical cases". The teacher of PEC, head of the operational unit Nasrytdinov T. S., as well as attending a practical lesson for residents of the 1-year training programme 7R01115 "Radiation Oncology", the teacher of PEC KazRIOR-Kim V. B., the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the start of the lesson, residents answer tests, receive feedback from teachers have the opportunity to improve their skills in their specialties. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, as experts have studied the Code of Academic Integrity of Residents, the Code of Honor of Teaching Staff and employees of KazRIOR, approved on 20.06.2022. and during the interview, the residents replied that they were informed about the content of these documents.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the

EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in the classroom. The volume of classroom work is 10% of the volume of each discipline, independent clinical work under the guidance of a clinical mentor - 75%, IWS - 15%.

The personnel policy requirements for faculty members and teachers who are engaged in residency training comply with the Charter and the KazRIOR Human Resources policy. The system of mentoring, which is described in the document in the Regulations on the resident clinical mentor, was evaluated. There are 6 mentors in total, whose tasks are to attach the resident doctor to the patient, train the resident by conducting joint rounds, coordinating the examination and treatment plan, monitoring the resident's work in the department, participating in MDG, and evaluating practical skills.

Independent training of residents is represented by studying literature, working in KIIS.

Training of trainees is conducted in accordance with the current policy of professional organizations.

In accordance with article 48 of the Law on Education "Health Protection of Residents" and the fourth section of the "RoK Labor Code" "Occupational Safety and Health", KazRIOR assumes an unconditional obligation to provide healthy and safe conditions for training residents at clinical bases. The beginning and end of the daily work of a residency student is regulated depending on the mode of operation of the clinical base and the individual work schedule of the student. The duration of the daily work of a residency student lasts from 8 to 17 hours, including breaks.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and obligations is reflected in the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KR DSM-16 On approval of the "Rules for Training medical personnel in internship" and "Rules for training medical personnel in residency". When studying at KazRIOR, the rights of residents regulated in the RoK Constitution, the " Education Law of RoK " (as amended on 07.07.2020), the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 11, 2011 No. 483-IV "On Religious Activities and Religious Associations", the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 11, 1997 are guaranteed. Year No. 151-I "On Languages in the Republic of Kazakhstan" (with amendments and additions as of 26.12.2019). Compliance with these laws demonstrates the equal rights of residents observed in KazRIOR

This is evidence of compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The qualifications obtained as a result of completing the residency training programme correspond to level 7 of the national framework of qualifications in medical education and, consequently, the Structure of Qualifications in the European Higher Education Area. **(ESG 1.2)**

The educational organization adapts training to the needs and wishes of individual students, for example, residents with disabilities, from low-income families and national minorities.

Along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, the organization has an anti-plagiarism system.

## **2.2 The scientific method**

Scientific research is a mandatory component of training and involves the integration of educational, practical and research processes, with the result in the form of publications of scientific papers, speeches at conferences of various levels. During the first year of study, residents of the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" in 2018-2019 participated in the STP " New molecular genetic methods for pre-symptomatic diagnosis and treatment of a number of significant diseases "(KazRIOR Contract with the Customer of the State Institution Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 68 dated June 8, 2017), KazRIOR contract with head organization of Asfendiyarov KazNMU No. 164/07. 17 dated 10.07.2017, agreement with the co-executor of PSE on REM Institute of General Genetics and Cytology of the Ministry of Education and Science RoK No. 026-17-mu dated 17.07.2017). Materials for the participation of KazRIOR employees and residents are presented in the Attachment, Table 7. Resident oncologists of 2 years of training Musagulova A., Makhsetova Sh. published an article "Using the EORTC QLQ-C15-PAL

palliative care questionnaire to assess the quality of life of cancer patients in clinical group IV" in the journal Life Science and Health, with an impact factor RSCI of 0.048.

The educational programmes include scientific foundations and methodology of medical research. Knowledge of the basics of evidence-based medicine is mandatory in the course of residency training in the specialties "Oncology (adult) and "Radiation Oncology". As part of the implementation of the IWR, the EP provides training of residents in the skills of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data by writing essays, presentations in accordance with the thematic plan of the discipline, essays on topical issues of diagnosis and treatment of the most common diseases.

When talking to residents, experts learned that they use scientific data in training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. Teachers said that they teach residents the methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, as well as the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of a "magazine club", which is held once a month.

Residents and trainees have access to updated scientific and clinical data, as KazRIOR is accredited to conduct clinical trials of pharmacological and medicinal products, medical devices and medical equipment (Order No. 39 of 24.02.2017).

KazRIOR publishes the journal "Oncology and Radiology of Kazakhstan", part of the RSCI, HAC MON RoK. It also provides free access to practical experience, as it has its own clinical base with 430 beds and specialized departments. There are 12 clinical departments in total.

In the survey of residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to students' participation in research work and 100%-15 people - are fully satisfied with this. Residents should be engaged in research and in the answer to the questionnaire they wrote that 60 % (9) are already engaged in research, 13.33 % (2) are planning to start, 20 % (3) are searching for a research topic, and 1 resident is not engaged in research yet (6.67%).

### **2.3 Teaching and learning methods**

For 2 years of training, residents work in clinical departments and KAZRIOR centers. Clinic is accredited and involves the provision of high-quality patient-centered medical care, while respecting, first of all, the safety and autonomy of the patient. To master clinical skills, students have the opportunity to undergo training in departments of various profiles in accordance with the topics of practical classes and those competencies that are defined in the educational programmes of specialties.

By studying at KAZRIOR, residents have the opportunity to gain knowledge about the organization and scope of medical care at all levels, from primary health care to highly specialized.

Residents are involved in the process of evaluating educational programmes by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course of study or mastering a specific discipline, or by conducting a survey to identify opinions and take into account comments and suggestions of direct consumers.

The experts noted that they took into account the comments and suggestions of residents on the organization of the educational process (class schedule, etc.), the programme of training in elective subjects, the list of elective subjects, the library fund and other issues directly related to the learning process. During the EEC visit, it was found out that in working with residents, training is conducted using updated clinical protocols, treatment recommendations, own and borrowed implementations in clinical practice. However, the EEC members noted that innovative teaching methods are not fully used and are not reflected in syllabuses.

### **2.4 Programme structure, content and duration**

EP of the residency programme in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" was developed in accordance with SCES-2022 dated 04.06.2022 (MoH RoK order No. KR DSM-63), designed for 140 credits: profile disciplines - 134 credits, elective component-4 credits, final certification-2 credits. Residency training in the specialty 7R01115 "Radiation oncology" is carried out on a full-time basis, the training period is 2 years. According to the SCES (No. KR DSM-63 dated 04.07.2022), the educational programme for training resident oncologists is designed for 140

credits: specialized disciplines - 138 credits, of which the mandatory component – 134 credits, the elective component-4 credits, and the final certification – 2 credits.

The distribution of subjects by hours, semesters is carried out by PEC according to SCES, TEP and the list of elective subjects. An individual working curriculum is formed for each resident for the entire period of study, coordinated with the curator and approved by the head of the PEC.

The PEC is responsible for selecting and implementing innovations in the educational process.

Considering the relevance of studying the early diagnosis of malignant tumors in accordance with the State Programme for Health Development RoK for 2020-2025 (RoK Government Decree No. 982 of 26.12.2019) the content of work programmes and the catalog of elective subjects reflected the needs of the EP health care system in the specialty 7R01115 "Radiation Oncology" and taking into account the opinions of stakeholders, the elective component included the discipline: "High-tech radiation therapy", which reflects the issues of various modern options and methods of radiation therapy (CRT, BCT, IMRT, IGRT, RapidArc, SRT, SRS) aimed at improving local and regional treatment with increasing overall and relapse-free survival rates and reducing the risk of post-radiation injuries. as well as the specifics of research and scientific achievements of teachers. For successful implementation of residency programmes, the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of practical skills of residents (in departments of various profiles in accordance with the topic of practical classes and those competencies that are defined in the educational programmes of specialties, the center for simulation technologies).

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 73.33 % are fully satisfied, 26.66 % are partially satisfied, 0 % are not satisfied.

Students of advanced training programmes are also provided with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature.

The organization has its own clinical database. The clinic is deployed on 430 beds for the provision of GVFC, where more than 9500 patients are treated annually., as well as signed contracts with medical organizations, including foreign ones ( KAZRIOR is in cooperation with scientists and institutes from Italy, France, the USA, South Korea, Georgia, Latvia, Mongolia and other countries). And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 73.33 % (11) of residents answered with full agreement, 20% (3) partially agree, 6.67% (1) disagree. At the same time, 73.33 % (11) of residents claim that after completing classes, the teacher conducts feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts mini-questionnaires, and works on errors).

Clinical training is provided in third-party multidisciplinary clinics, and staff coordinate training at these clinics to ensure that residents acquire adequate training in various aspects of their chosen field of medicine. For example, in the AOC and the Ministry of Emergency Situations of Almaty.

To the question "Do residents' representatives participate in the development of educational programmes?", the experts received a positive answer.

The surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions 46% (7 people)

## **2.5 Organization of training**

The management of the educational process reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the PEC and conversations with the manager and employees. At the same time, the verification of **standard 2** showed that employees, residents and representatives of practical health care are involved in the process of managing educational programmes through their inclusion in advisory bodies and through regular sociological surveys.

Experts got acquainted with the work of departments, including (Center for Molecular Genetic Research, Endoscopy and Functional Diagnostics, Department of Chemotherapy, CCMT, AOC, CTO, operation block, COG. In total, 15 meetings were held and cross-interviews revealed that the Azov institution, where students and residents are trained in residency specialties, is



a questionnaire has been developed, which includes questions on the quality of the educational process, compliance with schedules and schedules, anti-corruption policy, etc.). The data obtained are discussed at meetings with the management and heads of structural divisions, with students.

## **2.7 Approval procedure for educational programmes**

The EEC noted that KAZRIOR has developed mechanisms for approving educational programmes that provide for evaluating programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analyzing results and implementing changes, which allows monitoring the EP implementation process and the progress of residents, and ensures that emerging problems are identified and resolved in a timely manner. EP's are approved by EMC.

It is established that the expert examination of the EP is carried out by a PEC specialist, for compliance with SCES, approves the CED according to the proposals of stakeholders and taking into account pre- and post-requirements, evaluates the choice of methods for evaluating the results of residents' training. PEC carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of the EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, implementing tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of training methods), as well as evaluating the educational support and support of the educational process, and evaluating the quality of the EP. For this purpose, an external assessment of the EP is carried out by a competent representative of practical health care.

*Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.* Out of 33 standards conform: fully - 32, partially-1, do not meet-0.

*Standard 2: completed*

*Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:*

1) Expand the use of innovative teaching methods and reflect them in syllabuses (PBL, TBL, CBL, etc.).

## **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT AND DOCUMENTATION**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **3.1 Evaluation methods**

The study of control and measurement tools showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. Control and measurement tools are developed for all topics of the curriculum, have a concise formulation, essential content and thematic feature: Current control-assessment based on an assessment sheet, checklist (seminar, report on duty, analysis of a thematic patient, maintaining medical records, operational and communication skills, etc.). All types of current control (practical classes, seminars, IWRT, IWR) and border control are calculated on a 100-point system. During the interview, the residents told about the assessment forms and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appeal of assessment results is reflected in the document (Attachment 6 "Academic Policy for 2022-2022 academic year") and during the period of work of the educational organization, there were no applicants of appeal. For conducting an appeal, the order of the head of KAZRIOR creates an appeal commission from among experienced teachers whose qualifications correspond to the specialty profile.

So, to verify the data of **standard 3**, the experts asked questions to the head of the Center for Postgraduate Education Esenkulova S. A.: 1. How are classroom classes conducted for residents? 2. What additional methods are used to assess residents? 3. Do residents' written works pass through the anti-plagiarism programme? Responses were received: 1. Classroom classes are conducted according to WEP groups by a curator. 2. B KAZRIOR uses additional methods for evaluating residents, such as portfolios and evaluation of research activities. 3. Permanent works of residents all materials are examined through the online anti-plagiarism programme.

Experts checked documents and methods for evaluating residents and trainees. The organization has control questions, test tasks (MCQ tasks with multiple correct answers), a list of

practical skills, situational tasks, and clinical situations that were compiled by methodologists and teaching staff and approved at the EMC PEC meeting (Protocol No. 1 of 20.06.2022). The review of control and measurement tools is carried out at several levels-internal-from KAZRIOR specialists and external review, when employees of external organizations, associations or employers act as reviewers. Reviews are recorded at the EMC meeting.

Для слушателей Test questions and tasks have been compiled for students.

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with Aizhan Dzhakipbayeva, a PEC specialist, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and residents, and training and methodological documentation. documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), certificates, certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the above-mentioned documents required for residents and there is information that is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with Saule Esenkulova, head of PEC

### **3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning**

The results of the resident assessment are documented as follows. The methodology for registering learning outcomes is spelled out in the SDE and is presented in the KAZRIOR Academic Policy, as well as in the documents posted on the website.

The results of the assessment of KAZRIOR residents are reflected in the minutes and reports of the SAC Chairmen.

The organization evaluates the reliability and validity of evaluation methods. The development of new control and measurement tools is carried out by teaching staff through the study of world experience in assessing knowledge in postgraduate education, then implemented in the educational process. Test tasks for conducting current, milestone and final control for residents are presented mainly in the MCQ format (2, 3 levels of difficulty), in the ratio of 50% to 50%, in the amount of 300 per year, 100 tests per 1 resident, and are updated annually.

To validate the assessment of residents, employees of basic institutions and patients are involved (360-degree assessment). Scientific work is reviewed and evaluated when residents speak at conferences, publish articles. When conducting interviews with 11 teachers regarding assessment methods, the experts obtained convincing information that the assessment methods are fully comparable with teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all resident competencies both during practical classes and during exams. Residents also shared their opinion on the timeliness of providing tests, conducting counseling before exams, understanding the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, residents said that the assessment criteria are brought to the attention of residents at the first lesson in each discipline, and are also presented in the syllabus. The observers also expressed their opinion on the assessment methods and were completely satisfied.

During the visit to the organization, the management was asked: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?". And the answer was received: the commission included leading professors, KAZRIOR employees, representatives of other universities, and practical health care.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, practical training is carried out on clinical bases through daily personal participation of a young specialist in the treatment and diagnostic process, using the principles of evidence-based medicine, both in the classroom and during independent work.

The interviewed 4 representatives of employers also pointed out that the training of graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since the basic institution where the actual training of students is conducted is multidisciplinary, which fully provides the necessary thematic recruitment of patients provided for in educational programmes. The diversity of KAZRIOR provides a patient-based approach to teaching, as students have access to a sufficient number of patients, which contributes to the improvement of their practical competencies.

KAZRIOR has been accredited as a medical organization and has certificates attesting to the high quality of providing medical care to the population. Employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of residents, as they are included in the examination boards. Employers believe that it is necessary to return and assign the specialty "Oncology" to surgical disciplines.

### **3.3 Edocumentation**

Experts found that the procedure for planning, organizing, monitoring and analyzing evaluation methods in KAZRIOR ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. Residents who have completed their training under the residency training programme and passed the Final state certification are awarded the qualification of an oncologist or radiation oncologist and are issued a state-issued document.

Feedback results are taken into account when planning for improvement, contributes to a better understanding of the current needs of residents and teachers, and is systematic in making changes to the educational programme.

*The EEC conclusions on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: fully – 15.

*Standard 3: completed*

## **Standard 4: THE HEALTH CARE PROFESSIONALS**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **4.1 Admission and selection policy**

The organization has a policy on the admission of residents, which corresponds to the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education" dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, SCES RoK-2022 and the Rules for admission to the KAZRIOR residency programme for the current academic year. Oksana

Shatkovskaya, Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board of KAZRIOR JSC for Scientific and Strategic Work, spoke about the policy of accepting residents. Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, the "Rules for admission to the KAZRIOR residency programme for 2022-2023 academic year" (No. 1 dated 20.08.2022). Indicators of qualitative academic performance of oncologist residents for the 2016-2020 academic year are 100%, the average score is 3. For 2016-2017 academic year, the quality indicator has not changed for the number of students who are eligible for admission to the KAZRIOR residency programme, so that the average score is 3.33. In subsequent years, the average score was 3.3 with a quality score of 97%.

Students are accepted in accordance with the Educational Activities at KAZRIOR, which are carried out in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319 "On Education", the State Programme for the Development of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2020 and the State Programme for the Development of Health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025, bylaws of the Ministry of Education and Science RoK and MoH RoK, as well as in accordance with ISO 9001:2015.

There is a balance between the existing potential of the educational organization and the opportunities for training and recruitment of students and trainees, since the organization has its own clinic with a strong material and technical base. KAZRIOR resources, teaching staff, the number and powerful material and technical equipment of the clinical base, the professionalism of practical health care employees (clinical mentors)

When selecting residents, those who have the highest rating in the specialty are considered, scientific achievements corresponding to the profile of the chosen specialty are taken into account: publications, certificates of scientific developments, certificates of awarding scientific scholarships, grants, certificates/diplomas for participation in scientific conferences and competitions, the level of English that teachers can determine during the interview.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. All criteria are met. Experts got acquainted with the documentation on the admission of residents, including the "Rules for admission to the KAZRIOR residency".

Experts interviewed residents about the practice of academic counseling, personal support for residents, and the development of other professional skills. Residents are included in the advisory bodies. By order of the Chairperson of the Management Board of KAZRIOR, D. R. Kaidarova, two residents of the 1st year of training in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" were included in the composition of EMC for 2022-2023 academic year: D. S. Endalov and B. B. Zhumataev (Order No. 267a of 27.08.2022).

#### **4.2 Motivation**

Experts noted that the organization of education ensured that the provision of high-quality medical care was the driving force behind the participation of students and trainees in educational programmes. The content of the programme in accordance with the disciplines is carried out on the basis of the latest world recommendations, data from multicenter studies, and advanced educational technologies are used. An important part of the educational process is training in communication skills and patient safety standards to prevent unintentional incidents.

Academic advisory work at KAZRIOR includes advising students throughout their studies and before intermediate and final attestation. For personal growth and development of residents, in addition to the magazine club, sports sections and creative teams, KAZRIOR has a sufficient resource base (Internet, 100% coverage of the territory of KAZRIOR WiFi, library, museum, reconstructed and improved territories of the main buildings).

#### **4.3 Number of students and trainees**

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the MoH RoK State Order for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical and practical training, the maximum allowable load on the center's teaching staff, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, as well as material and technical resources of the Center.

Since KAZRIOR JSC became a part of NJSC "KazNMU", since 2019, all residents are enrolled in NJSC "KazNMU" by state order, and therefore there has been no new admission since the 2019 academic year.

Every year, taking into account the need for medical personnel in the regions, the center sent a request about the need for clinical specialties of residency in the DNR MoH RoK. In accordance with the submitted request, the DPR allocated a State order for the training of medical personnel in residency.

#### **4.4 Support and consultation**

Prior to the beginning of the PEC interim assessment, a schedule for conducting a course consultation is developed and approved. Experienced teachers, associate professors, and professors are involved in the consultation. In addition, before the start of each semester, the group teacher informs its residents about the work schedule, the time when residents can seek advice on this discipline. Residents are consulted based on the results of assessment and survey of residents. During the academic year, it can be presented both in-person and in remote forms (on online platforms, in chats, etc.).

The EEC has made sure that KAZRIOR uses all the main directions, forms and methods of organizing social and financial support adopted in the MOO. Educational work is carried out in accordance with the Charter of KAZRIOR, the Comprehensive Action Plan for 2018-2022 for the implementation of the Development Strategy of KAZRIOR for 2019-2023, Internal Regulations, plans developed on the basis of legislative and regulatory acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Resolutions of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, annual Presidential Addresses to the people of Kazakhstan, which define goals, objectives, directions organizations. PEC KAZRIOR has built-in trust boxes to provide students with anonymous feedback. Support is provided to protect the health of residents. There is a blog of the Chairperson of the Board of KAZRIOR, an internal information forum, and information about the helpline is provided.

In order to facilitate the employment of graduates, KAZRIOR annually conducts a Personal distribution of graduates with the participation of representatives of health departments, pharmaceutical companies and public health departments of RoK.

#### **4.5 Representation of students and trainees**

During the visit and familiarization with Experts, it was noted that residents are involved in the work of EMC, EP assessment commissions, participate in the volunteer movement (lists of volunteers who participated in work in dispensary clinics and quarantine sites, in the CVI pandemic, and the council of young scientists). Thus, by order of the Chairperson of the Board of KAZRIOR, D. R. Kaidarova, two residents of the 1st year of study in the specialty 7R01124 "Oncology (adult)" are included in the EMC for 2022-2023 academic year Endalov D. S. and Zhumataev B. B. (Order No. 267a of 27.08.2022). Students together with the teaching staff have a real opportunity to participate in the organization of the EP specialty during direct training, discussion and approval of work programmes, at the level of developing an individual work curriculum and elective subjects. Residents expressed their desire to listen to a series of lectures on nosology during feedback on the educational process, which was taken into account by the PEC.

#### **4.6 Training strategies**

The IEPI is compiled for each academic year based on the WEPI approved for the corresponding academic year and the Catalog of Elective Subjects. IEPI formation is the responsibility of the PEC and the teaching staff. For residents transferred from other universities, reinstated, remaining for a second year of study, returning from academic leave, the IEPI is compiled on the basis of the WEPI approved for the corresponding academic year, taking into account the difference in the curriculum or academic debt. However, experts noted that in order to develop the ability of each individual student and listener to systematically plan, perform and document training, the IEPI based on practice in response to certain training needs has not been finalized.

The principles of organizing the educational process using distance learning technologies are set out in the KAZRIOR Academic Policy, Order No. 1 of 20.06.2022.

#### **4.7 Working conditions**

RoK Government Resolution No. 799 of 10.10.2022 amended RoK Government Resolution No. 116 of 7.02.2008 "On approval of the Rules for the appointment, payment and size of state scholarships to students in educational organizations", resident doctors in the field of training "Health care" - 100036 (one hundred thousand thirty-six) tenge, which is 23085 tenge more than previous years' scholarship.

Combining training with work (no more than 0.5% of the rate) in areas of activity close to his future specialty, in his free time, is allowed with the consent of the curator, head of the department and PEC.

If you have a specialist certificate, residents of the 2nd year of study are allowed to conduct independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions, during extracurricular hours.

During the visit to the clinical base, the EEC experts found that residents have unlimited access to patients, all types of medical equipment and all departments of the clinical bases. The center has rooms for conducting theoretical classes with residents, there is a separate room for changing clothes, eating, etc.

During their training, residents actively participate in consultations, MDGs, medical conferences, patho-anatomical conferences, clinical reviews, master classes, and scientific and practical conferences.

The academic load of residents is planned in accordance with the RoK Law "On Education". The class schedule from 08.00 to 17.00 hours is regulated by the EP developed on the basis of SCES 2022, sanitary and epidemiological rules and regulations, curricula and recommendations of health and education authorities.

Residency work is the main and dominant responsibility of a resident.

When working on clinical bases, all types of responsibility for causing harm to the life and/or health of residents, employees and third parties when performing any activities on the territory of the Clinic are fully assigned to the Clinic (clause 34 of the Agreement on Joint Activities with the clinical base).

**Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.** Out of 31 standards conform: fully - 30, partially-1, do not meet-0

**Standard 4: completed**

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

1) Finalize the IEPI based on the individual trajectory of the resident.

## **Standard 5: CPD PROVISION**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **5.1 Recognition Policy**

During the EEC visit, it was found out that KAZRIOR has a State License of the MSI "Department of Entrepreneurship and Industrial and Innovative Development of Almaty" of the Akimat of Almaty for engaging in medical activities No. 18018249 dated October 03, 2018 with appendices and a State license No. KZ82LAA00012887 dated 04.03.2010 (without term), with Appendices dated 28.09.2018 for engaging in educational activities in the following areas: three specialties of postgraduate education: radiation therapy (radiation oncology), Oncology (adult) and radiation diagnostics.

#### **5.2 Commitments and development of post-graduate and additional education organizations**

In July 2022, JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology" successfully passed National Accreditation in accordance with the rules and requirements of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan with the assignment of Category I for a period of 3 years (Certificate of accreditation, registration number KZ37VEG00012515 dated 27.07.2022).

As approved by the decision of the KAZRIOR Board of Directors dated 10.07.2020. No. 5 The KAZRIOR Strategic Plan for 2019-2023 includes the third direction-Modernization of medical science and education. Improvement of the system of diploma and postgraduate education and continuous professional development of personnel in the oncological service.

#### **5.3 Recruitment and teacher selection policy**

There are 11 employees in total – all full-time employees. Experts are familiar with KAZRIOR's HR policy and Regulations on mentors.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on the personnel policy, which, for the implementation of EP, is carried out through a competition to fill vacant positions. When applying for a job to fill teaching positions, it is mandatory to take into account the compliance of candidates with the qualification requirements.

The conversation with the head of PEC S. A. Esenkulova included such questions as 1. What are the main indicators that characterize specialists, do you attract as a teaching staff for residents? 2. According to what regulatory document is the staff of teaching staff determined? Answers:1. The main indicators that characterize specialists engaged as teaching staff for residents are the following characteristics: the presence of an academic degree and title, scientific and pedagogical experience and experience in the position held, activity in scientific and methodological and research work, etc. 2. The staff of the residency teaching staff is determined in accordance with the main provisions of the order of the Minister of Health RoK No. 474 of June 14, 2004 "On approval of the norms for calculating the cost of tuition for one student, residency student, master's student, doctoral student (PhD) in educational organizations and scientific organizations in the field of health care within the country under a state educational order" and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (in total, such teachers 17 people), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, information security of the

educational programme, as well as identify problems in the management and development of human resources.

In a survey of teachers, it was found that all (100%) are fully satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results – 100% completely agree, Satisfied with the work of the HR service - 100% completely agree. Satisfied with the salary – 60% fully agree, 30% partially.

#### **5.4 Teacher commitment and development**

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received opinions on approaches to developing teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. During a conversation between EEC experts and representatives of management personnel, it was established that KAZRIOR's HR policy for personnel development consists in planning, developing incentive measures and rewarding for achievements in work. Types of incentives and the procedure for their application are determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Experts received answers about the teacher training programme. Teaching staff were trained in advanced training in medical education in RoK, near and far abroad countries. During the reporting period, 11 employees completed advanced training in pedagogy in the following cycles: "Methodology of education in health care", "Distance technologies in education", "Using MCQ in evaluating trainees and residents", "Effective communicator", "Development of communication skills of teachers of clinical disciplines in higher education institutions", "Training of teaching staff of clinical departments universities".

Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. However, insufficient training for advanced teaching skills was found.

There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 100% of the surveyed teachers answered that they agree with this. 60% of students were trained in professional development programmes less than 1 year ago, and 40% were trained more than 5 years ago.

The organization implements social support programmes for teachers - 70% answered that "yes, there are such programmes", and 10% of respondents do not know about it.

**Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.** Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 14, partially-1, do not meet-0.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

- 1) Provide advanced teaching courses for curators and clinical mentors.

## **Стандарт 6: EDUCATIONAL AND CPD ACTIVITIES**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

The material and technical base of KAZRIOR includes: 2 conference halls, 5 study rooms, a library, a simulation class, access to information technologies, clinical and paraclinical departments. The classroom fund consists of five classrooms with a total area of 168.1 sq. m. The classrooms are fully equipped for seminars/practical classes, they have the necessary cabinet furniture, technical training facilities, including personal computers. The capacity of classrooms is from 10 to 20 seats. 2 conference halls (134.4 sq.m and 100.8 sq. m) equipped with personal computers, projectors and special screens are used for conducting lectures. Continuous work is being carried out to improve IT technologies and infrastructure of the center, uninterrupted operation of the Internet network throughout the center has been ensured, and a local computer system has been created.

During the survey of students and teachers during the visit to the Institute, it was found that the teaching staff and residents are fully satisfied with the resources and bases of practice.

## **6.2 Training bases**

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities. The bed capacity is 430 beds. 310 hours of round-the-clock stay. In total, there are 12 clinical departments, each of which is a clinical center operating on a multidisciplinary principle, that is, treatment options for each patient are decided by commission according to the regulations for a multidisciplinary group, according to international standards for choosing treatment tactics for cancer patients. There is a clinical and diagnostic center (polyclinic), designed for 300 visits.

Employees of the educational organization ensure a collegial and ethical relationship with the medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. There is a sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills they should acquire and develop during their training.

During a visit to clinical bases, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical health care. The experts obtained evidence of compliance **with standard 6**, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time for patient supervision, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and teacher qualifications, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Magazine Clubs", availability of international databases of professional literature as a resource. In general, residents are satisfied with the training and assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, while residents would like more independence in managing patients and conducting international events.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, funding, and demonstrated English language proficiency. The experts examined the documents of residents (portfolios, results of the residents 'assessment-checklists, results of the residents' survey).

## **6.3 Information technology**

KAZRIOR has a scientific library. The library consists of 5 departments: reference and bibliographic; acquisition and storage of literature; scientific processing of literature and cataloging; automation and electronic resources; subscription department.

The library's total collection includes more than 10,000 copies of literature. The fund includes books, dissertations, abstracts, and periodicals in the state Russian and foreign languages.

KAZRIOR Research Library has signed contracts with international companies for access to the following electronic Databases.

During the EEC visit, it was noted that the scientific library is equipped with computers, a video projector, screens, multipliers and copying equipment. Information support for the work of residents and cadets is provided through: Media (Facebook, Instagram, etc.); the Institute's website; television monitors in the foyer of academic buildings; official information boards of the Institute; PEC information boards. KAZRIOR JSC has an IT department that provides access for clinicians, residents, and cadets to the web portal, the clinic's Internet resources, and electronic media options.

## **6.4 Interaction with colleagues**

Every day, resident oncologists and radiation oncologists participate in joint rounds with mentors, consultations, MDGs, and consultations with other specialized departments. Residents also conduct seminars on topical issues of clinical medicine themselves, where students of all levels, as well as health care workers and teaching staff, attend. Students and residents develop skills of coordination of work with colleagues and other health care professionals during the examination, treatment of the patient, and, especially, those who are at the stage of progression of the tumor process in order to solve both basic and problematic tasks in the management and tactical support of treatment tasks.

Students have free access to patients on clinical bases and all conditions for improving their practical skills-100% of teachers fully agree with this.

### **6.5 Formalized types of training**

Memoranda have been signed with foreign clinics to support international cooperation, exchange of resident doctors, and exchange of experience in the field of medical education, including training and seminars for specialists and residents.

KAZRIOR residents implementing EP, in addition to patient management, participate in all KAZRIOR events: October 15, 2022-Open Day for Breast Cancer detection; September 22-23, 2022-dedicated to the 100th anniversary of Academician S. B. Balmukhanov; September 08, 2022-master class on 3D pelvic bone reconstruction On September 22-23, 2022, Almaty hosted the International Scientific and Practical Conference "Modern Schools of Oncology – relevant to everything", in a hybrid format (offline +online), etc.

### **6.6 Medical research and development**

Experts have established that patients conduct scientific research while performing independent work, in the process of collecting clinical material and analyzing database data. For conducting scientific research, residents are provided with access to equipment for conducting scientific research and scientific events conducted at clinical training bases. Residents can independently conduct patient surveys, perform diagnostic and therapeutic procedures in accordance with the list of manipulations, in accordance with the requirements of the SCES RoK (2015, 2020). Before performing research, a resident must report to the Local Ethics Commission of the Institute and obtain permission to conduct research. Scientific and research work of students is presented in the form of sections, circles, scientific societies, webinars, master classes, etc. KAZRIOR residents have a high potential and potential to perform research during the entire training period.

Interviews with 11 teachers showed that there are successes in the management of education, depending on the specific base (access of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work).

### **6.7 Expertise in the field of education**

In order to ensure the quality of educational programmes, KAZRIOR has created an educational and methodological council, which includes teachers, leading clinical staff, and administrative and managerial staff. Evaluation and approval of educational programmes and modules is carried out at EMC.

The objectives of KAZRIOR include: development of educational activities. The goals of the educational programme are interrelated with the development of a quality culture in the center. Quality control over the implementation of educational programmes is carried out in accordance with the internal audit plan and orders of the Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board of KAZRIOR JSC for scientific and strategic work, who oversees the educational process.

### **6.8 Training in other institutions**

Memoranda have been signed with foreign clinics to support international cooperation, exchange of resident doctors, and exchange of experience in the field of medical education, including training and seminars for specialists and residents. For example, with the Curie Institute (France), where training is planned. KAZRIOR residents can visit the NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU" simulation center, in order to implement educational programmes, which provides the training process with simulation technologies, where skills are developed on dummies, dummies,

simulators, computer training programmes. There were no shortcomings in the implementation of this section of the standard.

*Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.* Out of 25 standards conform: fully-25.

*Standard 6: completed*

## **Standard 7: EVALUATION OF CPD ACTIVITIES**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

Based on the analysis, the EEC experts found that the internal system for ensuring the quality of education in KAZRIOR is provided by the Department of Science and PEC. Evaluation and improvement of the EP is carried out with the participation of all stakeholders, which include leading teachers, experts in the field of medical education, employers, as well as students. The Deputy Chairperson of the Board of JSC "KAZRIOR" for Scientific and Strategic Work and the Head of PEC manage, organize, coordinate the work of all departments and are responsible for the implementation of educational programmes. This activity is carried out in accordance with the MoH RoK and MES RoK regulatory documents, as well as internal regulatory documents: 1) The RoK Laws "On Education", "On Science"; 2) Order No. 647 of the Acting Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 On Approval of State mandatory standards and standard documents. professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties, as amended in 2020; 3) "Standards and Recommendations for quality assurance of higher education in the European Area", developed by the European Association for Quality Assurance of Higher Education ENQA; 4) Charter. On the recommendation of independent experts and employers, the description of the content of disciplines was updated and the list of elective component disciplines is being optimized.

As a result of the survey, 100% of teaching staff are satisfied with the organization of the educational process in this educational institution. In a survey of residents, 40% of teachers use almost all teaching methods. 45% of residents rated their clinical training at KAZRIOR as "excellent". 76% of residents are satisfied with the way they are trained on a clinical basis, i.e. they are completely satisfied with the created environment for obtaining and developing skills and competencies. Based on the results of the survey, plans for corrective and preventive measures were developed.

#### **7.2 Feedback**

The Institute has implemented a system for monitoring the quality of educational programmes by studying feedback from students, trainees, teachers, employers and applying the results of feedback analysis to improve educational programmes. Feedback contains information about various aspects of the educational process, information about unfair practices or inappropriate behavior of teachers or students. Work on providing feedback to students is carried out through questionnaires and meetings."

According to the regulations, the survey is conducted on a regular basis in accordance with the work plan for monitoring the quality of the educational process for the current academic year. The main principles of the survey of consumers of educational services provided by the Institute are:

1. Compliance of the questionnaire content with the strategic goals and objectives of the Center.
2. Anonymity of participation.
3. Systematic and consistent survey procedures.
4. Use standardized survey procedures and criteria.
5. Continuity.
6. Informative content.

The survey is conducted according to the following types: "Teacher through the eyes of students", Students 'satisfaction with the conditions and results of training'," Satisfaction with

infrastructure", "Graduate satisfaction with the quality of training", "First-year student questionnaire". The survey is conducted online via Google, as well as on paper. The coverage of respondents in various questionnaires ranged from 45% to 75%.

Based on the results of the survey "Teacher through the eyes of students", a report and reference are compiled for each teacher with an assessment of students.

Materials of the survey of all interested parties (students, employers, teachers) are discussed at the Academic Council and an analytical report based on the results of the survey is considered. The report data is analyzed, compared with real facts, cause-and-effect relationships are clarified, and then a decision is made to make changes to the organization of the educational process, EP.

For the purpose of feedback, the Institute conducts an annual survey of employers. Thus, the degree of employers' satisfaction with graduates is assessed to identify the compliance of the educational programme with real labor market requirements, opportunities for its improvement, as well as the degree of compliance of graduates' competencies with workplace positions.

### **7.3 Stakeholder engagement**

Experts found that a wide range of stakeholders participated in evaluating and improving educational programmes at KAZRIOR. It is provided by the authorized bodies in the field of education and health (MoH RoK), representatives of the public, professional organizations, as well as persons and structures responsible for postgraduate education: in KAZRIOR, an independent assessment of residents' knowledge is made; employers, which include medical institutions of regional health departments of the Republic, are responsible for creating an effective system for promoting employment and adaptation training of graduates in the labor market, drawing up reviews of doctors on the results of field practice of residents; representatives of the committee for control of medical and pharmaceutical services and representatives of practical health care are involved as members and examiners of the state attestation commission for the final certification of graduates, participate in their distribution.

All stakeholders (teaching staff, residents, employers) are involved in the programme evaluation process through representation in the relevant structures. The work of all structures that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the educational programme is regulated by the strategic development plan of the Center, annual plans and reports of the Center. Evaluation results are heard at EMC meetings.

Interviews with 4 employers were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc. Employers expressed a wish to graduate more district oncologists, given their shortage. Also dissatisfaction with the fact that the specialty "Oncology (adult)" does not belong to surgical disciplines.

*Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.* Out of 17 standards conform: fully -17.

*Standard 7: completed*

### **Standard 8: ORGANISATION**

#### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **8.1 Documentation and requirements for education planning**

The residency programme is implemented in accordance with the state license No. KZ82LAA00012887 dated 04.03.2010 (without term), Attachment to the license dated 28.09.2018 for educational activities in three specialties of postgraduate education: radiation therapy (radiation oncology), Oncology (adult) and radiation diagnostics. Experts noted that enrollment in the residency programme is carried out in accordance with the Minutes of the MoH RoK Commission Meeting No. 1 dated 17.05.2022 on the placement of the state educational order for training

medical personnel in the residency programme for the 2022-2023 academic year, KAZRIOR JSC has allocated 13 places in two specialties: 7R01124 - Oncology (adult) and 7R01115-Radiation oncology.

SCES of 04.07.2022 residency programmes in medical specialties and the standard professional training programme in medical specialties of residency approved by Decree of MoH and SR RoK of 31.07.2015 No. 647, which *determine the content of the educational programme*.

KAZRIOR has *developed and approved the main internal document* defining the scope of responsibilities and powers of KAZRIOR in relation to the EP residency, including the obligation to provide the educational process in full with all necessary information sources and access to online educational resources, including the "Academic Policy of KAZRIOR "(No. 1 No. 5 of 20.06.2022). This document guides the PEC in managing the residency training programme. Coordination of implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programmes in all licensed specialties is carried out by PEC under the supervision of the Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board for Scientific and Strategic Work of KAZRIOR JSC. Students who have completed the EP residency and successfully passed the final certification are issued a state-issued document on the qualification of an oncologist and a radiation oncologist. Based on the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 39 dated January 28, 2015 "On approval of types and forms of state-issued educational documents and Rules for their issuance", in accordance with subparagraph 6-3) of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007, a certificate of completion of residency is issued, also after passing the final The National Center for Independent Examination (NCIE) issues a certificate of a specialist without a category in the relevant specialty.

## **8.2 Academic leadership**

The educational process is managed in accordance with the KAZRIOR organizational structure KAZRIOR (approved by the Board of Directors No. 11 of 23.12.2021).

The executive body of KAZRIOR is its Chairperson of the Management Board. Residency issues are under the supervision of the Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board for Scientific and Strategic work in the educational process and the Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board for Clinical Work – in clinical activities. PEC's activities are managed by a manager appointed by order to the Chairperson of the Management Board. The composition of the PEC, consisting of AMP and TS, is approved by the order of the Chairperson of the Management Board. The advisory educational and methodological body is the educational and methodological Council. EMC consists of the following positions: head (Chairperson of the Board); professors and associate professors; representatives of interested parties (experts, residents, employers, representatives of professional associations). When implementing the EP, PEC interacts with all structural divisions in accordance with the KAZRIOR Organizational Structure (approved by the Board of Directors No. 11 dated December 23, 2021).

The direct management of residency programmes and coordination of residents ' activities since the establishment of the residency is carried out by the PEC. To the question of the questionnaire "Do the managers of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, and clinical work", 100% of teachers answered that they regularly do.

## **8.3 Allocation of budget and resources for education**

The KAZRIOR budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for training postgraduate education personnel, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers); the local budget; and the provision of paid educational and other services. Funding for the residency programme depends on the formation of an annual state order. Every year, the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approves the state educational order for training specialists with higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with which the financing of residency programmes by type of educational institutions is determined. Experts found out that the center plans to introduce and implement EP residency programmes in the specialties "Oncology (adult)" and" Radiation Oncology " on a paid basis.

## 8.4 Administration

Administrative, managerial, service and educational support staff is calculated on the basis of the MoH RoK Order "Norms for calculating the cost of training for one student, postgraduate student, clinical resident (master's student) in higher medical educational institutions within the country under the state educational order" dated 14.06.2004 No. 221. During the EEC visit, it was clarified that the staffing table of teaching staff providing educational residency programmes is approved annually, taking into account changes in the number of residents. According to Article 52 of the RoK Law " On Education " of 27.07.2007 No. 319-Sh, the total number of teaching staff is formed based on the average ratio of residents and teachers-3: 1. The calculation of the teaching load of teaching staff is made in accordance with the Standard Rules of Higher Education organizations (RoK Government Resolution No. 499 of 20.05.2013) and the state standard of education (MoH RoK Order No. 387 of 29.07.2009 and Order No. 647 of 31.07.2015) and in residency is-680 hours per year (Order No. 7 of 08.09.2015).

The system of internal assessment, monitoring of the teacher's work and achievement of intermediate and final results of educational programmes is carried out through the certification of teaching staff in all types of activities, but experts noted that the clinical audit, management and quality service does not have an employee responsible for the educational process.

## 8.5 Requirements and regulations

EP's in the specialties 7R01124 " Oncology (adult)" and 7R01115 "Radiation Oncology" are formed in accordance with: State mandatory residency standard No. KR DSM-63 dated 04.07.2022, "Professional standards and qualification system" approved in Article 117 of the Labor Code RoK No. 414-V dated 23.11.2015 (with amendments and additions as of as of 30.11.2017); "Rules for training medical personnel in internship and rules for training medical personnel in residency", MoH RoK Order No. KR DSM-16 dated 18.09.2018, registered with the MOH RoK on 12.10.2018 No. 17534, etc. The programme is approved in close cooperation with all interested parties. The structure and content of the WEPI correspond to the SCES for the specialties "Oncology (adult)" and 7R01115 "Radiation Oncology", the programmes of the disciplines are developed at the proper scientific and methodological level. The sequence of studying the residency disciplines is constructed using a system of pre - and post-requirements.

**Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.** Out of 16 standards conform: fully-14, partially -2, do not meet-0

**Standard 8: completed**

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

1) Introduce an employee responsible for monitoring teaching activities into the existing quality management system.

## Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

### Proof of compliance:

In order to continuously improve the educational process, in accordance with the best practices of the world educational management, taking into account the needs of practical health care, RoK regularly initiates a review and update of processes.

To implement the competence-based model of medical education and ensure continuous improvement of the quality of the educational process, there are structures –PEC, Academic Council, Council of Young Scientists.

A convincing example of the process of continuous improvement of approaches to the implementation of educational residency programmes is the active participation of stakeholders (first of all, representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the Institute's social responsibility for the development of advanced innovative technologies in practical medicine and science, the use of information and communication technologies, as well as

To eliminate the documented shortcomings in its activities, the Center provides for: changes in the organizational structure of departments involved in the educational process; changes in the current regulations on the organization, planning and implementation of the educational process; personnel changes; adjustment of curricula, EMC; adjustment of the educational methods used, test bases and the introduction of new ones; advanced training of teaching staff; material and technical information equipment of the educational process; promotion of highly qualified effective work of teaching staff; organization of additional work with low-performing residents.

***Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.*** Out of 6 standards conform: fully-6, partially-0, do not meet-0.

***Standard 9: completed***

Thus, when conducting an external institutional assessment, compliance with 172 accreditation standards was established, including 105 basic standards and 62 improvement standards. 2 basic standards and 3 improvement standards were partially implemented. No inconsistencies in the standards were found. The implementation of improvement standards indicates that the organization of education meets the international consensus on such areas as continuous professional development of doctors.

## **5. Recommendations for improving the institutional activities of the educational organization KAZRIOR JSC:**

1. Expand the use of innovative teaching methods and reflect them in syllabuses (PBL, TBL, CBL, etc.). (2.1.5)
2. Finalize the IEPI based on the individual trajectory of the resident. (4.6.1)
3. Provide advanced training courses for curators and clinical mentors. (5.4.4)
4. Introduce an employee responsible for monitoring teaching activities into the existing quality management system. (8.4.2, 8.4.3)

## **7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council**

The members of the EEC established compliance with the Standards for institutional accreditation of medical organizations of postgraduate and additional and non-formal education and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology" as an organization providing postgraduate, additional and non-formal education for a period of 5 years

### **Chairperson of the EEC**

KABYLDINA NAILYA AMIRBEKOVNA

### **Foreign Expert**

URMANBETOV KUBATBEK SAMYYBEKOVICH

### **Academic Expert**

SHAKIROVA AIDA FAZYLOVNA

### **Academic Expert**

URAZAEV OLZHAS NURLANOVICH

### **Expert Employer**

SHAMSUTDINOVA ALFIYA GUMAROVNA

### **Expert-Learner**

ABYLGAZIEVA AIDANA BAKY TZHANOVNA



Handwritten signatures of the EEC members, each on a horizontal line. The signatures are in blue ink and correspond to the names listed on the left.

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(summary)**

22	Evaluation criteria	Number of standards	Evaluation			
			Basic standards/ Standards Improvements	Fully compliant	Partially Compliant	Not Compliant
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	14	6/8	6/8		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	33	23/10	22/10	1/0	
3.	ASSESSMENT AND DOCUMENTATION	15	12/3	12/3		
4.	THE HEALTH CARE PROFESSIONALS	31	21/10	20/10	1/10	
5.	CPD PROVISION	15	9/6	9/5	0/1	
6.	EDUCATIONAL AND CPD ACTIVITIES	25	14/11	14/11		
7.	EVALUATION OF CPD ACTIVITIES	17	9/8	9/8		
8.	ORGANISATION	16	10/6	10/4	0/2	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	6	3/3	3/3		
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>172</b>	<b>105/62</b>			
				<b>172</b>		

**List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of the external evaluation of the  
residency training programme**

<b>No</b>	<b>. Names of documents</b>	<b>Number</b>
1.	Articles of Association	1
2.	Organizational structure of the Center	1
3.	Regulations on the Academic Council	1
4.	Regulations on the Department of Science and Education	1
5.	Minutes of approval of the main methodological materials on STP	6
6.	Protocol that indicates the approval of the mission and educational programmes	1
7.	Regulations on conducting advanced training, seminars and training modules in additional education	1
8.	Approval of the educational programme	3
9.	Approval of missions of educational activity of JSC KAZRIOR	3 (in Kazakh, Russian, English)
10.	Memoranda with foreign organizations	5
11.	Portfolio of residents	4
12.	Scientific work of residents	1 folder
13.	Documents of teaching staff (portfolio)	14
14.	control and measurement tools-tests, situational tasks, exam tickets, syllabuses	3 folders
15.	CMI reviews	10
16.	Reviews of EP	9
17.	Catalog of elective subjects	for 2 specialties
18.	SOP FSA, Credit transfer, current control, intermediate and final certification	4
19.	Questionnaires and survey results of employers and students on the modification of educational programmes and satisfaction with the educational process process	2 folders
20.	Code of Honor of teaching staff	1
21.	Code of honor of students	1